



Hiding Spinach in the Brownies: Frame Alignment in Suffrage Community Cookbooks, 1886–1916

Stacy J. Williams

To cite this article: Stacy J. Williams (2016) Hiding Spinach in the Brownies: Frame Alignment in Suffrage Community Cookbooks, 1886–1916, *Social Movement Studies*, 15:2, 146-163, DOI: [10.1080/14742837.2015.1027764](https://doi.org/10.1080/14742837.2015.1027764)

To link to this article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14742837.2015.1027764>



Published online: 16 Apr 2015.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



Article views: 58



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)

Hiding Spinach in the Brownies: Frame Alignment in Suffrage Community Cookbooks, 1886–1916

STACY J. WILLIAMS

Department of Sociology, University of California, San Diego; La Jolla, CA, USA

ABSTRACT *Recent studies have examined how the conventions of cultural genres help advance frames. This line of scholarship can be used to study how activists might popularize radical frames that fundamentally challenge widespread beliefs. In this article, I analyze how the gendered character of suffrage community cookbooks aids in frame alignment. I determine how these cookbooks advance ‘femininity frames’ that drew on widespread beliefs about femininity (and thus were more likely to resonate with a broad audience). I also examine how suffrage cookbooks advance ‘republican citizenship frames’ that argued that women should vote because they could embody the masculinized republican ideals of civic virtue and public responsibility. Republican citizenship frames challenged widespread beliefs about femininity (and thus were likely to be viewed as more radical). I find that the embrace of domestic femininity in community cookbooks amplifies femininity frames by intensifying traditional beliefs about women. Furthermore, the gendered character of community cookbooks extends republican citizenship frames to the average housewife by proving that women could incorporate new practices into their lives without abandoning their traditional feminine roles. This study enriches our understanding of the roles of cultural genres in framing, and it demonstrates how activists may try to popularize radical frames.*

KEY WORDS: Resonant and radical frames, genre, frame amplification, frame extension, gender, women’s suffrage, community cookbooks

The suffrage movement was the first mass social movement in the USA that aimed to advance women’s rights. From 1848 to 1920, when the Nineteenth Amendment was passed, suffragists advocated for women’s ability to vote. In their attempt to gain adherents and convince male voters and legislators of their cause, suffragists often took to marching, delivering speeches, canvassing door-to-door, gathering signatures for petitions, and publishing suffrage literature such as newspapers and pamphlets (Anthony & Harper, 1922; Kraditor, 1965; McCammon, 2003).

In addition, some suffragists published material that was not traditionally used for political purposes. Several suffrage organizations compiled and sold community cookbooks to raise funds for their work. Community cookbooks were, and still are, a symbol of traditional domestic femininity. In these cookbooks, women from a community (often a town, church, or organization) share family recipes with readers, who are usually

Correspondence Address: Department of Sociology, University of California, San Diego, 9500 Gilman Drive, 0533, La Jolla, CA, 92093-0533, USA. Email: Sjw006@ucsd.edu

© 2015 Taylor & Francis

other women in the community. Community cookbooks selectively document pieces of women's domestic roles, but they also instruct how to replicate these feminine domestic tasks. In fact, due to community cookbooks' feminine nature, some suffragists believed cookbooks were too conservative for a women's rights group (Richards, 2008, p. 185). In the face of these insider critics, some suffragists persevered, publishing cookbooks and even boasting about their display of traditional femininity. For example, a suffrage newspaper that advertised the *Washington Women's Cook Book* argued that the suffragists' cookbook proved 'that the eternal feminine underlies the suffrage campaign and women are not being unsexed by their demand for votes for women' (Anonymous, 1910).

Suffragists' community cookbooks did not only teach readers how to cook, but they also explained why women should be enfranchised. In this article, I demonstrate how the gendered character of suffrage cookbooks – that commitment to the 'eternal feminine' – helped advance two types of suffrage frames: what I call 'femininity frames' and 'republican citizenship frames.' In femininity frames, suffragists argued that women should be enfranchised because their supposedly inherent characteristics, such as morality, would make them good voters. These frames drew on dominant beliefs about femininity and thus were more likely to resonate with a broader audience (Buechler, 1986; McCammon & Campbell, 2001; McCammon, Campbell, Granberg, & Mowery, 2001; Snow & Benford, 1988; Snow, Rochford, Worden, & Benford, 1986). In republican citizenship frames, suffragists argued that women should be enfranchised because they exhibited republican ideals of civic virtue and public responsibility (e.g. Dagger, 1997). In other words, suffragists argued that women could act with a discerning eye for the public good rather than private self-interest. At the turn of the twentieth century, most Americans viewed republican citizenship as a masculine realm (Haydu, 2008; Quigley, 2002). When suffragists argued that *women* could exhibit republican citizenship, suffragists challenged widespread gender understandings. Thus, republican citizenship frames were more radical than femininity frames.

I argue that community cookbooks' commitment to domestic femininity works in different ways to align femininity frames and republican citizenship frames with readers' beliefs. The gendered character *amplifies* femininity frames. In frame amplification, activists clarify and intensify frames for an indifferent audience (Snow et al., 1986). By situating these frames within a genre that teaches women to fulfill their domestic feminine roles, suffragists amplify the ideas about femininity that were included in these frames. Alternatively, the gendered character *extends* republican citizenship frames by making movement goals relevant to women's lives (Snow et al., 1986). By including republican citizenship frames in community cookbooks, suffragists assured women readers that they could be model republican citizens without abandoning their traditional work in the home.

Therefore, suffrage community cookbooks, typically marked by conservative gender ideals, carry some of the suffrage movement's more radical gendered frames. This resembles a cooking tactic popularized by cookbook author Seinfeld (2008), in which a cook hides vegetables in foods that many people consider more enjoyable. For example, cooks might be unsure if their family would otherwise eat spinach, so they conceal spinach in something such as brownies, which their family is more likely to consume. Similarly, suffragists included more radical republican citizenship frames, which fewer people would be likely to accept, in a cultural object that had more widespread appeal.

This article contributes to recent conversations about how the conventions of various cultural genres, from cartoons to novels, help advance frames in ways not previously considered (Coley, 2015; Isaac, 2012; Morrison & Isaac, 2012). I develop this literature in two ways: first, by showing how the gendered character of cultural genres can advance frames, and second, by demonstrating how cultural genres enable frame alignment for both more resonant and more radical frames. This enriches our understanding of how activists can popularize radical frames, which helps us conceptualize how movements challenge the status quo and achieve cultural change.

Frame Alignment in Cultural Genres

Studying suffrage frames allows us to see how suffragists interpreted the vote for a broader audience (Gamson & Modigliani, 1989; Snow & Benford, 1988). As Benford and Snow (2000, p. 614) explain, collective action frames ‘help to render events or occurrences meaningful. [...] Frames are action-oriented sets of beliefs and meanings that inspire and legitimate the activities and campaigns of a social movement organization.’ Oliver and Johnston (2000, pp. 41, 43) clarify that frames are specific ways of explaining an issue or a piece of ideology, or an ‘individual cognitive structure.’

In their seminal work on framing, Snow and his colleagues (1986) present four ‘frame alignment processes’ that attempt to convince an audience of the goals of social movements or other forms of collective action. In frame bridging, activists attempt to gain support from an audience that is already sympathetic to the cause but that lacks the ‘organizational base’ for acting on their beliefs (Snow et al., 1986, p. 467). In frame amplification, activists clarify and intensify their arguments for an indifferent audience. Frame extension explains to this indifferent audience how the goals are pertinent to their lives and interests. Finally, in frame transformation, activists attempt to win over a hostile audience by replacing adverse understandings with frames that are more sympathetic to the cause.

Most previous studies of framing have examined ‘expository writing,’ in which activists or journalists use media such as pamphlets, speeches, websites, newspapers, or magazines to convey facts or explain goals to a broad audience (Coley, 2015; Rohlinger, Kail, Taylor, & Conn, 2012). Other genres have unique conventions that allow activists to communicate meaning in different ways. For example, in their analysis of Industrial Workers of the World cartoons, Morrison and Isaac (2012) argue that conventions of cartoons allow for visual frame amplification. In an entirely different manner, a novel’s narrative and moral can try to convince readers of movement goals by amplifying and extending frames (Coley, 2015; Isaac, 2012). These scholars have advanced our understanding of framing by illuminating how activists use a variety of cultural genres – not just newspapers and speeches – to communicate movement ideas.

The roles that genre-specific conventions play in frame alignment can help us examine an understudied phenomenon in social movements: how activists attempt to popularize radical frames. Movements advance a wide range of frames, and some resonate with a broader audience more successfully than others. Other frames are more radical and pose greater challenges to widespread beliefs (Ferree, 2003). While all frames must be both resonant and radical – without resonance, frames would be incomprehensible, but without radicalism, frames would suggest no changes to the status quo – frames can slide along the spectrum of resonance and radicalism (Hewitt & McCammon, 2004). Radical frames are

often less successful in mobilizing adherents and become marginalized within a movement (Ferree, 2003). However, it is not well understood how activists might try to popularize radical frames. According to the logic put forth in studies about radical and resonant frames (e.g. Ferree, 2003), to popularize radical frames, activists would have to replace the more radical ideas with those that would align more easily with an audience's beliefs.

I present a new way of understanding how activists can advance radical frames. By including radical frames in media that belong to familiar genres or subgenres, activists might popularize these frames without removing the radical ideas. I suggest that prominent themes or expectations of cultural genres can make the radical frames relevant to the lives of audience members. In the remainder of this article, I examine how the gendered character of community cookbooks helps advance both more radical and more resonant suffrage frames.

Community Cookbooks as a Cultural Subgenre

Publishing a cookbook became a popular way for American women's groups to raise money in the late nineteenth century. Women from organizations such as churches, towns, clubs, and junior leagues published between 3000 and 6000 community cookbooks before 1916; the estimates vary so widely because these cookbooks are not often preserved (Cook, 1971; Longone, 1997). Until the twentieth century, community cookbooks were mostly a white, middle- to upper-class, Protestant phenomenon (Nussel, 2006; Schenone, 2003).

Community cookbooks, also called charitable or fundraising cookbooks, are a distinct subgenre of cookbooks. Just as a reader can (usually) distinguish a romance novel from a science-fiction novel, a reader familiar with the subgenre can recognize a community cookbook from a general cookbook. Community cookbooks, like other genres and subgenres, are marked by a 'horizon of expectations,' or the expectations that a reader has of any cultural object that is classified within a certain genre (Griswold, 1987; Jauss, 1982). Community cookbooks have conventions of form, recipes, and gendered character that set them apart from other subgenres of cookbooks.

At the turn of the century, general cookbooks were usually written by one author for personal profit. These books were often hefty encyclopedic volumes authored by leaders of the domestic science movement. General cookbooks such as Fannie Farmer's *Boston Cooking-School Cook Book* taught women to adhere to nutritional knowledge of the day, measure ingredients with standardized and exact measurements, and maximize efficiency while cooking (Schenone, 2003; Shapiro, 1986).

Community cookbooks form their own distinct subgenre. I focus here on the conventions of turn-of-the-century community cookbooks. Typically, one or two women in the organization gathered recipes from other members of the group (Bower, 1997b; Schenone, 2003). The result often contains recipes from hundreds of women, with the contributor's name listed after their recipe. Many recipes are simply a list of ingredients with no directions for what to do with them; this trend reveals that many contributors assumed their readers were practiced home cooks. The recipes do not follow one system of measurement. In addition, community cookbooks often include several recipes for common dishes, since every woman wanted to contribute her version of the staple. Women commonly contributed poems, Bible quotes, and 'recipes' for things such as keeping a

husband or raising children (Longone, 1997). Finally, community cookbooks often contain advertisements from local businesses.

Suffrage community cookbooks follow these conventions of the subgenre that delineate them from different types of cookbooks. Like other community cookbooks, suffrage cookbooks do not stick to one system of measurement. In the *Woman Suffrage Cook Book*, recipes call for butter that is measured in pounds, ounces, teaspoons, tablespoons, spoons, cups, and coffee cups; other recipes require little, small, and large pieces of butter; still others compare pieces of butter to the size of an egg, walnut, nutmeg, or hickory nut (Burr, [1886] 1890). Suffrage cookbooks also have many recipes for popular dishes. For example, the breads chapter of *Choice Recipes for the Busy Housewife* contains four recipes for ‘Nut Bread,’ three for ‘Graham Bread,’ and three for ‘Bran Muffins’ (Clinton Political Equality Club, 1916). In addition, several of the suffrage community cookbooks offer recipes for things other than food. The following recipe from *The Suffrage Cook Book* gives instruction on the art of feminine love and care:

Hymen Bread

1 lb. genuine old love

7/8 lb. common sense

3/4 lb. generosity

1/2 lb. toleration

1/2 lb. charity

1 pinch humor

(always to be taken with a grain of salt.)

Good for 365 days in the year. (Kleber, 1915, p. 107)

Similar to recipes for a happy marriage or raising a good child that are common in other community cookbooks, these directions for behaving like an ideal woman are dispensed in the genre-specific form of a recipe.

The ‘Hymen Bread’ recipe also exemplifies another convention of community cookbooks – a gendered character that emphasizes the ideals of traditional domestic femininity (Ferguson, 2012; Nussel, 2006). The intended audience of turn-of-the-century community cookbooks was primarily women (Longone, 1997; Schenone, 2003). Cookbooks can be read as instruction manuals for domestic femininity (Neuhaus, 2003), teaching women how to fulfill their socially expected roles as the main caretakers of the family and home (Welter, 1966).¹ In addition to recipes for food, these books also include chapters of household cleaning hints, directions for caring for the sick, recipes specifically for children, and decorating tips. However, the femininity in community cookbooks could only be fulfilled by a small percentage of middle- to upper-class white women. Therefore, it is important to remember that the feminine ideals in these cookbooks have race and class dimensions. While many other subgenres of cookbooks also contain this feminine character, several subgenres do not. For example, barbecue cookbooks or cookbooks for professional chefs adopt a more masculine character, as these books are aimed at men.

Suffrage cookbooks follow the feminine character that is typical of community cookbooks. The recipes and household tips within suffrage cookbooks teach women to fulfill their duties as housewives. For example, the *Woman Suffrage Cook Book* contains directions for household tasks such as ‘To Cleanse Soiled Ribbons and Laces,’ ‘To

Remove Mildew,' and 'To Preserve the Complexion,' in addition to over 400 cooking recipes (Burr, [1886] 1890, pp. 128–129). Other recipes such as the above-mentioned 'Hymen Bread,' instruct how to radiate femininity. Thus, suffrage community cookbooks follow the convention of the subgenre and demonstrate a commitment to domestic femininity.

Femininity Frames and Republican Citizenship Frames

I analyze how the gendered nature of suffragists' community cookbooks advanced some frames that drew on, and other frames that challenged, widespread understandings of women. Suffragists in the late nineteenth century often argued that feminine qualities made women qualified to vote. For example, a common suffrage frame emphasized that since women were more moral than men, giving them a vote would clean up political corruption. Scholars have termed suffrage arguments that invoke traditional femininity 'expediency arguments' (Kraditor, 1965) and 'separate spheres arguments' (McCammon et al., 2001), but to focus on the cultural beliefs that these arguments used, I refer to them as femininity frames. Femininity frames were more likely to resonate with a broader, more moderate audience because they used and bolstered widespread understandings of women (Buechler, 1986; McCammon & Campbell, 2001; McCammon et al., 2001).

Alternatively, republican citizenship frames challenged widespread understandings of women. In these frames, suffragists argued that women should vote because they could embody republican ideals. Republicanism traditionally values public responsibility and civic virtue, which can be explained as having 'the disposition to improve public over private good in action and deliberation' (Dagger, 1997, p. 13). In the era of the suffragists, republican citizenship was culturally defined as masculine (Dagger, 1997, p. 13; Haydu, 2008; Quigley, 2002).² The ability to suspend self-interest for the public good required a manly discipline and reason that many Americans considered beyond the capacity of women, who were supposedly more emotional (Haydu, 2008). Republicanism also justified men's exclusive use of the vote; since men were expected to consider the public good and take an active interest in current affairs, they were seen as the most qualified voters. Republican ideology had a separate role for women. 'Republican motherhood' stipulated that it was women's duty to raise honorable male citizens who would be ethical voters and politicians (Kerber, 1980). Thus, under traditional republicanism, women raised citizens but were not citizens themselves. Women's role in republicanism was private and domestic, not public.

Suffragists broke the mold by arguing that women could be republican citizens. By maintaining that women should vote because they could take public responsibility and have civic virtue, republican citizenship frames contested popular beliefs about femininity. Specifically, they challenged the notion that women's roles in the republic were solely private and domestic. For example, a common republican citizenship frame maintained that women should be able to vote because they were interested in politics and current affairs. This was a radical argument because it co-opted for women a previously masculinized piece of republican citizenship. These frames encouraged a more substantial reconfiguration of femininity that went beyond making voting acceptable for women. Therefore, republican citizenship frames were more radical than femininity frames, and they would likely have garnered less popular support. However, republican citizenship

frames might have been more palatable if suffragists delivered them in a familiar and comforting cultural genre.

Data and Methods

I analyzed seven cookbooks that were compiled or published by any American woman's suffrage organization before 1920, when the Nineteenth Amendment was ratified. I accessed three cookbooks through special collections libraries and three through digitized collections online. I discovered the final cookbook in a small town's historical society. I have found no mentions of additional surviving suffrage cookbooks in primary or secondary sources.³ The texts I analyzed are *The Woman Suffrage Cook Book* (Burr, [1886] 1890), *Holiday Gift Cook Book* (Rockford Equal Suffrage Association, 1891), *Washington Women's Cook Book* (Jennings, 1909), *The Suffrage Cook Book* (Kleber, 1915), *Enfranchised Cookery* (Hoar, 1915), *Suffrage Cook Book* (Equal Suffrage League of Wayne County, 1916), and *Choice Recipes Compiled for the Busy Housewife* (Clinton Political Equality Club, 1916).⁴

It is impossible to know who purchased these cookbooks. However, information about how the books were advertised and sold indicates that women inside and outside the movement may have purchased these books. For example, the Washington suffragists sold their cookbooks as they went door-to-door to ask voters if they supported enfranchising women (Anthony & Harper, 1922; Richards, 2008). These tactics likely resulted in women who were not members of a suffrage organization but were sympathetic or indifferent to the movement purchasing and reading the cookbooks.

Suffrage cookbooks differ from other community cookbooks because they include political discussions. Quotes from famous suffragists or essays supporting enfranchisement often sit alongside recipes or in chapters at the end of the book (see Figure 1 for an example of a page from a suffrage cookbook).

I used qualitative content analysis (Mayring, 2004) to analyze these cookbooks. I inductively assigned codes to suffrage frames. I defined a suffrage frame as a quote from a famous supporter or a paragraph within a longer essay that argued for women's enfranchisement. I coded these frames according to their main reasons for enfranchising women. For example, many suffragists argued that women should vote because women were more moral (this would be coded as morality); others argued that women should vote because they own property and pay taxes on it (this would be coded as property ownership). After completing coding, I sorted the frames into femininity frames and republican citizenship frames. To delineate between the two, I consulted historical secondary sources about the cultural constructions of femininity and republicanism. For example, I determined 'morality' frames to be femininity frames, since historians have argued that the culturally dominant femininity included purity and piousness (Welter, 1966). Furthermore, I deemed 'interest in government' frames to be republican citizenship frames, since taking an active interest in government is required to show public responsibility and civic virtue, the key values of republicanism. I then returned to these femininity and republican citizenship frames and interpreted how they fit within the context of the cookbook, paying particular attention to how the cookbooks' commitment to traditional femininity advanced these frames. This involved examining how each frame matched, challenged, or enhanced traditional feminine messages that pervade the books.

H. H. WALDO
 CAPITAL \$50,000.
 ESTABLISHED 1848. INCORPORATED 1887.
 HOLLAND, FERGUSON & CO.,
 REAL ESTATE AND LOAN AGENTS,
 ABSTRACTERS OF TITLES
 Conveyancers and Notaries Public.
 UNDER
PEOPLES BANK, Rockford, Ill.
 Andrew Gillich, President.
 W. H. Hill, Vice President.
 H. H. King, Secretary and Treasurer.
 Members Bankers' Real Estate Exchange.

RUCHER'S
TEMPERANCE
DINING HALL.
 221 E. State Street.
 YOUR PATRONAGE SOLICITED.

GO TO THE
METROPOLITAN SHOE STORE,
 113 W. STATE STREET.
 FOR THE
Best and Cheapest Footwear.

We also give elegant Pres-
 ents, which are displayed
 in window, with every
 sale of \$5 and over.

Heidenreich &
Hirshfeld.

CHRISTMAS
PRESENTS
 IN GREAT VARIETY.

D. S. HOUGH
 326 E. State St. Telephone 72.
 STRICTLY FIRST CLASS
GROCERIES
 BEST PATENT FLOUR.....\$1 45
 HALF PATENT..... 1 35
 OTHER GOODS IN PROPORTION.

JEWELRY
 You certainly buy Jewelry once in
 a while, why not buy where they make
 a specialty of Jewelry and are practical
JEWELERS.

I have got the Finest Jewelry Store in the
 city, and I don't care who knows it. . . . You
 certainly must give me one call before buying
 and be satisfied.

AL. E. HENRY,
West Side Jeweler,
 104 WEST STATE.
 opposite P. O.
 OLD GOLD AND SILVER TAKEN IN
 EXCHANGE FOR OTHER GOODS.

Suet Pudding.
 Two heaping cups of suet, 2 cups of sweet milk, ½ cup brown sugar,
 ½ cup molasses, 1 teaspoon of soda, a little salt, 2 heaping cups chop-
 ped raisins, flour enough to make a stiff batter; steam three hours.
 For sauce use ½ cup of butter stirred to a cream, add ½ cup sugar and
 1 teaspoon vanilla.—Mrs. ELIZABETH P. JOHNSON.

I believe in full citizenship for woman. She pays taxes as a citizen;
 why should she not have the right to representation as a citizen?
 —Henry W. Price.

Scotch Cookies.
 Beat to a cream 1 lb. of butter and 1 lb. of sugar; add 4 eggs, well
 beaten, and 2 lbs. of flour. Stir until very light; roll thick and cut
 with square cutter and sprinkle with candied caraway seed before bak-
 ing. These cookies will keep for several months.—Oliver J. Ross.

I believe that the great vices in our large cities will never be con-
 quered until the ballot is put in the hands of woman.—Bishop Simpson.

Pressed Veal.
 Four pounds of veal, ¼ package of gelatine, ¼ spoonful of ground
 cloves, ¼ spoonful of cinnamon, 1 onion. Soak the gelatine in cold
 water sufficient to cover it, fry the onion in the kettle in a little lard or
 butter; put in the veal and cover with water, when partly done add
 the spices, salt and cayenne pepper to taste, add a little water if neces-
 sary. When perfectly done, and the water nearly all evaporated, add the
 gelatine. With a knife or spoon break it up in small pieces, put in moulds
 and set away to harden.—LUCY A. ELLIS.

The obstacle to Woman's Suffrage is prejudice, and chiefly heredi-
 tary. The treatment for which is intelligent, fair and honorable: "put
 yourself in her place;" agitation, free from other prejudices, feelings of
 bitterness or spirit of vindictiveness. While the remedy is slow, fair-
 ness and the higher faculties are being exercised; the opposition is be-
 ing introduced to a higher train of thought and the general condition
 being bettered. In this way the ground may be prepared for equal
 suffrage.—Wm. Ross.

Brown Bread.
 Two quarts entire wheat flour and one cup of white flour. Take
 lukewarm water enough to make a batter; beat it up and put in a cup
 of home made yeast. Put in a warm but not hot place overnight. In
 the morning add 1 teaspoonful salt, 2 of sugar and 2 of melted butter;
 mix stiff and knead fifteen minutes. This will make three loaves; bake
 in not too hot an oven one hour.—Mrs. H. H. WALDO.

We need the participation of women in the ballot box. It is idle
 to fear that she will meet with disrespect or insult at the polls. Let
 her walk up firmly and modestly to deposit her vote and if any one
 ventures to molest her, the crowd will swallow him up as the whale
 swallowed Jonah.—Henry Ward Beecher.

Figure 1. Pages 2–3 from the *Holiday Gift Cook Book* (Rockford Equal Suffrage Association, 1891). Advertisements from local businesses fill one page. The next page alternates recipes with quotes from suffrage supporters. Image courtesy of Janice Bluestein Longone Culinary Archive, Special Collections, University of Michigan.

Frame Amplification and Extension in Suffrage Community Cookbooks

Both femininity frames and republican citizenship frames are prevalent in suffragists' community cookbooks (see Table 1). Suffrage community cookbooks amplify femininity frames by emphasizing traditional feminine roles and characteristics, which the frames then employ to argue that women should be enfranchised. Furthermore, the commitment to traditional femininity in community cookbooks extends the more radical republican citizenship frames to housewives. Situated within a community cookbook, republican citizenship frames communicate that women could fulfill their feminine roles even if they also engaged in customarily masculine practices. Each book contained both types of frames.

Table 1. Frequency of femininity frames and republican citizenship frames across seven suffrage cookbooks (N = 85).

Femininity only	42
Republican citizenship only	39
Both femininity and republican citizenship	4
Total	85

Downloaded by [University of California, San Diego] at 07:58 05 May 2016

Femininity Frames

In community cookbooks, suffragists frequently explain that women should vote because their ‘natural’ feminine nature would lead them to oppose corruption and endorse political reforms. These frames invoke characteristics such as morality and motherhood, which were part of the cultural construction of middle- to upper-class white femininity. On their own, community cookbooks demonstrate a commitment to this femininity. Thus, cookbooks amplify femininity frames by providing further evidence of women’s commitment to traditional feminine tasks and behaviors. Snow et al. (1986) argue that frame amplification is a clarification and intensification of arguments for an indifferent audience. While we cannot know for sure whether suffragists imagined their cookbook readers as indifferent or sympathetic to the movement, we can examine the roles that the cookbooks play in aligning femininity frames with widespread beliefs. I argue that suffrage cookbooks provide frame amplification rather than any other type of frame alignment for femininity frames (i.e. bridging, extension, or transformation) because the gendered character of cookbooks bolsters and intensifies the ideas about femininity that are included in these frames.

The most popular femininity frame in community cookbooks argues that women should be enfranchised because they would vote on the side of good morals, improving society and politics. For example:

The laws of Illinois for and in aid of good morals will be better and more surely enforced when the women have the same rights with men in selecting officers to enforce such laws. [...] – W. Scott Edwards, County Judge Fulton County (Jennings, 1909, p. 210)

Here, Edwards describes women as having a strong sense of ethics. Morality was a pillar of the dominant nineteenth-century cultural construction of femininity (Welter, 1966). In femininity frames that invoke morality, suffragists argued that enfranchised women would bring integrity to the political sphere. By calling upon the widespread understanding that women were more moral, these frames draw on a piece of the larger cultural construction of domestic femininity that is prevalent in the rest of the cookbook. Edwards’s quote is in a short chapter of quotes from prominent lawyers, judges, and politicians who offer reasons why women should vote. Although these speakers are mostly men, quotes such as Edwards’s call upon what were believed to be inherent feminine qualities to argue that women should vote. These frames are further amplified by the cookbook’s emphasis on these feminine qualities and roles. This chapter of quotes is at the end of the cookbook, and follows more than 200 pages of recipes and household remedies that teach women how to fulfill what is expected of them as middle- to upper-class white housewives.

While the gendered character of the entire book amplified femininity frames in chapters of suffrage arguments, other morality frames were amplified by being quite literally incorporated into the cookbook format. As I noted earlier, these ‘fake recipes’ usually instruct how to fulfill feminine roles, such as raising children or displaying womanly behavior. In the *Suffrage Cook Book*, this method of teaching femininity is harnessed to teach why women should vote. However, the argument for suffrage still relies on traditional understandings of women.

Pie for a Suffragist's Doubting Husband

1 qt. milk human kindness

8 reasons:

War

White slavery

Child labor

8,000,000 working women

Bad roads

Poisonous water

Impure food

Mix the crust with tact and velvet gloves, using no sarcasm, especially with the upper crust. Upper crusts must be handled with extreme care for they quickly sour if manipulated roughly. (Kleber, 1915, p. 147)

This recipe for convincing skeptical husbands of the suffrage cause draws on the cultural understanding of women as morally superior to men. The ingredients are social problems that suffragists argued women would fix if they had the vote, since femininity supposedly imparted women with morals that would lead them to vote for peace, purity (to eliminate 'white slavery,' or prostitution), and the abolition of child labor. The broader gendered character of the cookbook helps to amplify the feminine ideals in this frame. In the rest of the cookbook, when the recipes teach traditional femininity, they not only teach women to complete traditional feminine duties such as cooking, but they also teach traditional feminine characteristics such as nurturance, domesticity, and submissiveness (Welter, 1966). The cookbook's lessons on these feminine characteristics intensify the feminine ideals in 'Pie for a Suffragist's Doubting Husband,' such as women's morality, concern for the home and its amenities, and submissiveness and politeness toward the 'upper crust' or powerful people. In addition, the format of the 'fake recipe' helps with this amplification of feminine ideals. When included in a community cookbook, the recipe, whether teaching how to make a dish or a happy marriage, delivers a lesson about feminine duties. Since the recipe format implies a commitment to domestic femininity, it amplifies the feminine ideals that suffragists use to argue for the vote.

Femininity frames also invoke women's traditional role of motherhood. Women, as the moral authorities of the domestic sphere, were encouraged to shape their husbands and sons into ethical voters and honorable politicians (Kerber, 1980). In fact, this cultural construction of motherhood informed a major anti-suffrage argument, which maintained that women had no use for the ballot because they already influenced politics through their sons and husbands (Camhi, 1994). Suffragists argued that mothers should exert political power, but they maintained that mothers should directly participate in government. For example:

The true family is the type of the state. The government is now in a state of half orphanage. There are fathers of the state, but no mothers. – Rev. Samuel J. May (Rockford Equal Suffrage Association, 1891, p. 5)

Here, Reverend May compares women's maternal role in the family to the role that women should also play in the state. May draws upon ideas about mothers to argue that women should provide moral guidance and nurturing for the public sphere. He argues that the government

needs women's maternal expertise to improve the current political situation. May's emphasis on women as mothers fits the traditional femininity that pervades the cookbook. For example, the quote directly precedes a recipe for 'Home Fruit Cake' (emphasis mine). Together, May's use of motherhood and the recipe's modifier of 'Home' demonstrate an even stronger commitment to domestic femininity than they would have demonstrated alone.

Republican Citizenship Frames

It may seem unsurprising that suffragists used cookbooks to promote suffrage on traditionalist grounds. However, suffrage cookbooks also contained more radical frames. Within cookbooks, suffragists advanced frames that argued that women should vote because they could enact republican citizenship, which was previously culturally defined as masculine. These republican citizenship frames were more radical than femininity frames because they posed more of a challenge to dominant beliefs about women. Yet, appearing as they did within a community cookbook, the blow was softened. By placing republican citizenship frames in cookbooks, suffragists communicate that they did not expect women to abandon traditional feminine practices for these new ones. This helps achieve frame extension, or an explanation of how movement goals are pertinent to an audience's lives and interests (Snow et al., 1986), for the cookbooks demonstrate that readers could keep their feminine identities as mothers and housewives and still exhibit these new practices. In other words, the gendered character of community cookbooks extends radical frames by making them relevant to readers' lives. Community cookbooks do not amplify republican citizenship frames like they do for femininity frames, for the feminine character of cookbooks is at odds with the masculinized republican citizenship frames. Furthermore, these cookbooks do not attempt to transform widely held beliefs about femininity and replace them with ideas of complete gender equality – the fourth of Snow et al.'s (1986) frame alignment processes. Instead, community cookbooks extend republican citizenship frames by showing readers that these more radical ideas could be incorporated into their current lives.

In cookbooks, suffragists frequently argue that women should vote because they could own property and pay taxes. I include property ownership in republican citizenship frames because to exemplify civic virtue, one of the main tenets of republicanism, one should be financially independent (Dagger, 1997). At the end of the nineteenth century, property ownership was still culturally masculinized, since legal advances had only recently allowed married women to own property in some states (Chused, 1983). Yet, even in the feminized cultural object of cookbooks, suffragists frequently use the property ownership frame. For example:

Taxation without representation is tyranny. Our honored forefathers fought seven years, sacrificing their blood and treasure to establish this principle. Women are now taxed. Women are not represented. Is it any less tyrannical and oppressive for the women of today to submit to this injustice than it was for our fathers a century ago?
– Margaret T. Skiff (Rockford Equal Suffrage Association, 1891, p. 16)

Skiff points out that property ownership was a masculine practice that had justified American independence and white men's vote. The sentence 'Women are *now* taxed' (emphasis mine) alludes to property ownership being a new practice for women. Thus,

property ownership frames maintained that women should be able to vote because they could engage in the previously masculine practice of owning property.

Republican citizenship frames such as this one were more likely than femininity frames to anger anti-suffragists. Many ‘antis’ believed that suffragists encouraged women to jettison their traditional practices and replace them with masculinized ones (Camhi, 1994). Anti-suffragists believed that if women became involved in one masculinized sphere, such as voting, they would continue evolving into masculine creatures, abandoning their families as well as their feminine practices and traits (Behling, 2001). Antis’ fears of defeminization would be fueled by republican citizenship frames, in which suffragists encouraged women to engage in additional masculine practices besides voting.

Yet, by placing republican citizenship frames within a cookbook, suffragists imply that women should not replace their traditional feminine practices with these masculinized ones. For example, above, Margaret Skiff argues that women should vote because they can enact the masculinized practice of owning property. This frame falls directly after an advertisement for a local drug store that touts ‘Choice Perfumes, Toilet Articles, Fine Soaps, Sponges, Art Goods, Brushes – Tooth, Hair, Nail’ (Rockford Equal Suffrage Association, 1891, p. 16). Recipes for ‘Lemon Pie’ and ‘Cookies without Eggs’ follow Skiff’s quote. The ad appeals to the traditional concern with feminine beauty, while the recipes teach housewives to fulfill their duty as head cook and make delicate desserts. These markers of traditional femininity that surround the radical frame imply that women could still complete their traditional feminine tasks while also accomplishing a previously masculinized practice such as property ownership. By including this more radical frame in a cookbook, suffragists debunk the anti-suffrage argument that women would become defeminized and abandon their families. Suffrage cookbooks make republican citizenship frames relevant to the average housewife by demonstrating that women could own property and vote while continuing to cook, clean, and care for their families.

The ability for cookbooks to present republican citizenship frames in an appetizing way is best captured in frames that claim that women are interested in politics. To be an ideal republican citizen and fully participate in voting and leadership, one must show an interest in political issues (Dagger, 1997). In the late nineteenth century, only men were expected to pay attention to government and politics. Anti-suffragists capitalized on this popular belief and argued that women did not want the vote because they were uninterested in current affairs and the workings of the state (Camhi, 1994). Suffragists contradicted this by arguing that women were, in fact, interested in politics. For example, the Governor of Arizona assures readers that in his state, newly enfranchised women (Arizona women gained the vote in 1912) were active voters who paid attention to current affairs:

Not only have the women of this state evinced an intelligent and active interest in governmental issues, but in several instances important offices have been conferred upon that element of the electorate which recently acquired the elective franchise. [...] – W. P. Hunt, Governor of Arizona (Kleber, 1915, p. 110)

This frame contradicts turn-of-the-century understandings of femininity, which mandated that women should focus on home and family (Welter, 1966). Despite the fact that an interest in politics was culturally gender-typed masculine, suffragists claimed that women could follow politics and be knowledgeable in current affairs, and that this made them eligible to vote.

By including these frames in a cookbook, suffragists assure readers that women could continue their feminine duties while pursuing an interest in politics. Governor Hunt's letter falls in the middle of the chapter on 'Bread, Rolls, Etc.,' directly after the recipe for 'Dumplings that Never Fail' and before the recipe for 'French Rolls.' The Governor's letter also comes a few pages after the recipe for 'Hymen Bread' (above), which directed women on the art of feminine behavior. Sitting next to these recipes for bread and femininity, the argument about women's interest in politics implies that women could pursue this new hobby while still completing their traditional responsibilities. Therefore, cookbooks provide frame extension for republican citizenship frames by demonstrating that women can incorporate the ideas in these more radical frames into their everyday lives.

Other suffragists used cookbooks to make the same point more directly: women's interest in politics would not drive women away from the domestic sphere. The Wayne County suffragists introduce their cookbook with one such disclaimer:

The recipes were, for the most part, contributed by Detroit suffragists, and may help to show again what has been so often demonstrated before, that an interest in politics is not incompatible with an interest in cookery. (Equal Suffrage League of Wayne County, 1916, p. 3)

This is the first page of the cookbook – the first thing a reader sees after opening the cover. This sets the tone for the rest of the book, reminding the reader that women can be interested in politics and still cook any of the recipes that follow. By including this frame within cookbooks, suffragists insist that this new interest in government does not replace feminine practices such as cooking and caring for one's family.

In sum, community cookbooks' commitment to domestic femininity extends radical frames to moderate women readers. By including republican citizenship frames within a book that gives directions on achieving traditional feminine tasks, these new activities are reconciled with women's traditional roles as mother and housewife. While anti-suffragists tended to portray suffragists as defeminized women who abandoned their homes and families (Behling, 2001; Camhi, 1994), suffragists argued that women could take on previously masculinized practices without abandoning their traditional responsibilities. Thus, for suffragists, cookbooks were an ideal medium for advancing republican citizenship frames. While cookbooks' commitment to traditional femininity might seem antithetical to these arguments, this gendered character is precisely what might make these frames more appealing to a broader, more moderate audience. By placing these frames between recipes for food and instructions on fulfilling traditional feminine roles, suffragists demonstrated that a woman could accomplish new practices alongside her traditional feminine tasks.

Discussion

In this article, I join recent scholars who have turned to studying how the conventions of a genre allow activists to communicate certain frames (Coley, 2015; Isaac, 2012; Morrison & Isaac, 2012). These scholars have made important contributions by examining how visual, narrative, and other conventions of cultural genres aid in frame alignment. I advance this line of research by demonstrating how conventions of cultural genres can enable frame alignment for frames that draw on widespread beliefs and those that challenge these beliefs.

For femininity frames that drew on widespread understandings of women, community cookbooks' commitment to traditional femininity provided frame amplification. The cookbooks' recipes and household tips teach the ideals of domestic femininity. When a cookbook reader encounters a femininity frame that claims that women should vote because they are more moral than men, the belief in women's morality is intensified by the surrounding lessons in femininity. The cookbooks strengthen the idea that women – and suffragists – display traditional femininity that, in turn, justifies why they should be enfranchised. Thus, in the case of suffrage community cookbooks, the gendered character of the cultural genre amplifies frames that draw on dominant understandings of women.

In addition, community cookbooks' commitment to traditional femininity extends the radical republican citizenship frames to make them palatable to middle- and upper-class white women readers. While some readers could have interpreted republican citizenship frames in newspapers as suffragists hoping to abandon traditional femininity, it would be much harder to reach this conclusion after reading republican citizenship frames in a cookbook. Community cookbooks' domestic femininity assures the reader that even if women owned property and were interested in government, women would not fully jettison domestic femininity. Thus, community cookbooks' gendered character aids with frame extension, signaling to readers that they could perform these new practices while also remaining dedicated housewives and mothers.

This process of frame extension aligns the radical frames with widespread beliefs, but not in the manner in which we are used to frames achieving resonance. Usually, scholars explain that the power of resonance comes from within the frame itself, ignoring the role that the cultural medium may play (Oliver & Johnston, 2000; Snow et al., 1986). In this article, I suggest that the cultural object in which a frame resides may help popularize the frame. In short, context matters. I argue that the gendered character of a cultural genre can demonstrate to readers how a radical frame is relevant to their lives.

This process is like baking spinach into brownies to encourage children to eat their vegetables (Seinfeld, 2008). Children may reject spinach because they do not like the taste, and readers might have rejected republican citizenship frames that did not align with their beliefs about women. However, children might be more likely to eat spinach, and readers might be more likely to accept more radical frames, if these things are 'baked into' something they know they like. Parents and activists who wish for more radical transformations may object to this tactic because the overall change is small. In the end, children are still eating brownies, and readers are still committed to domestic femininity. However, getting the spinach or radical frames into children's and readers' diets might be a step toward more substantial change.

Conclusion

In this article, I have shown how the gendered character of suffrage cookbooks aids in frame alignment for more resonant and more radical frames. This demonstrates the importance of the cultural genre in framing attempts. Although my focus here is on cookbooks' role in frame alignment, this was not the only purpose that cookbooks served for the suffrage movement. A movement's cultural products can serve multiple purposes, including frame alignment, resource mobilization, and communicating information (Adams, 2002). While suffrage cookbooks aided in frame alignment, they also attempted

to mobilize resources by fundraising for the cause. However, not all suffrage cookbooks successfully raised money (Richards, 2008).

Cookbooks may not be the only site in which activists use a relatively conservative cultural genre to advance more transgressive frames. Other movements might use different cultural genres as their ‘brownies.’ One can imagine the LGBT movement pushing for marriage equality within bridal magazines. Alternatively, the fat acceptance movement might advocate for their cause within fitness magazines. On the surface, these cultural objects seem antithetical to each movement. This is because we expect certain things from these subgenres of magazines or books (Griswold, 1987; Jauss, 1982). The conventions of these subgenres (such as the glorification of heterosexual marriage in wedding magazines or the worshipping of slim, hard bodies in fitness magazines) seem to contradict the very message of these social movements. However, social movements can take advantage of these expectations of cultural genres, possibly attracting audience members who otherwise might not pay attention to the movement, and possibly encouraging others to think that the movement does align with their beliefs.

This article is limited in its ability to test readers’ responses to radical suffrage frames in cookbooks. Some cookbook readers may have realized that women could be enfranchised republican citizens *and* remain dedicated housewives. However, it is also possible that some readers used suffrage cookbooks solely for the utilitarian purpose – learning how to cook a variety of dishes – and ignored the quotes and essays that contained the suffrage frames. The scarcity of historical data makes it impossible to know the reactions of these cookbook readers, but future research can examine how readers respond to other movements’ attempts to ‘hide spinach in the brownies.’ Future research may also determine whether this process sparks cultural change. This research would join other studies that examine framing and cultural change (Snow, Tan, & Owens, 2013). In sum, this article uncovers how activists include transgressive messages in cultural objects that belong to more conservative genres. This advances our understanding of how activists use cultural genres for various framing purposes (Coley, 2015; Isaac, 2012; Morrison & Isaac, 2012), but it also demonstrates how activists may attempt to popularize their more radical ideas.

Acknowledgements

I wish to thank Jeffrey Haydu, Mary Blair-Loy, Amy Binder, Kwai Ng, and Laura Rogers for their feedback on many earlier drafts of this paper. I also thank my New York and San Diego writing groups for their suggestions and encouragement. Finally, thanks to the anonymous reviewers of *Social Movement Studies* for their advice.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

Funding

The research for this article was made possible by grants from the Schlesinger Library, the UCSD Dean of Social Sciences, and the UCSD Department of Sociology.

Notes

1. Even though many of the women organizing and reading community cookbooks probably employed cooks, housewives were in charge of coordinating these employees and likely still helped in the kitchen (Bower, 1997a; Levenstein, 1988).

2. Femininity frames and republican citizenship frames also contained class and race dimensions. Femininity frames invoked ideals of middle- to upper-class white femininity. Republican citizenship was a part of middle- to upper-class white masculinity.
3. Secondary sources have mentioned additional suffrage community cookbooks that may have existed at one point in time, but I have not found any mentions of additional *surviving* community cookbooks (Anonymous, 1917; Anthony & Harper, 1922, p. 371).
4. I accessed these cookbooks through Michigan State University's Feeding America historic cookbook digitization project, University of Michigan's Janice Bluestein Longone Culinary Archives, Project Gutenberg, the Schlesinger Library, and Clinton (New York) Historical Society.
5. While each book contained both femininity and republican citizenship frames, the number and proportion of each varied across cookbooks. I do not detail this variation because this would shift the focus to the local determinants that shape framing decisions rather than addressing the task at hand: explaining how conventions of cultural genres aid in frame alignment for different types of frames.

References

- Adams, J. (2002). Art in social movements: Shantytown women's protest in Pinochet's Chile. *Sociological Forum*, 17, 21–56. doi:10.1023/A:1014589422758
- Anonymous. (1910, July). Suffrage cook books. *Votes for Women*. Seattle, WA: Washington Equal Suffrage Association.
- Anonymous. (1917, April). The home and the vote: A new kind of woman's page. *National Suffrage News* (Vol. 18). New York: National American Woman Suffrage Association.
- Anthony, S. B., & Harper, I. H. (1922). *The history of woman suffrage* (Vol. 4). Indianapolis, IN: Hollenbeck Press.
- Behling, L. (2001). *The masculine woman in America, 1890–1935*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Benford, R. D., & Snow, D. A. (2000). Framing processes and social movements: An overview and assessment. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 26, 611–639. doi:10.1146/annurev.soc.26.1.611
- Bower, A. L. (1997a). Our sisters' recipes: Exploring 'community' in a community cookbook. *The Journal of Popular Culture*, 31, 137–151. doi:10.1111/j.0022-3840.1997.3103_137.x
- Bower, A. L. (1997b). *Recipes for reading: Community cookbooks, stories, histories*. Boston: University of Massachusetts Press.
- Buechler, S. M. (1986). *The transformation of the woman suffrage movement: The case of Illinois, 1850–1920*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.
- Burr, H. A. ([1886] 1890). *The woman suffrage cook book*. Boston, MA: Hattie A. Burr.
- Camhi, J. J. (1994). *Women against women: American anti-suffragism, 1880–1920*. Brooklyn: Carlson Publishing, Inc.
- Chused, R. H. (1983). Married women's property law: 1800–1850. *Georgetown Law Journal*, 71, 1359–1426.
- Clinton Political Equality Club. (1916). *Choice recipes compiled for the busy housewife*. Clinton, NY: Courier Press.
- Coley, J. S. (2015). Narrative and frame alignment in social movements: Labor problem novels and the 1929 Gastonia strike. *Social Movement Studies: Journal of Social, Cultural and Political Protest*, 14, 58–74. doi:10.1080/14742837.2013.873861
- Cook, M. (1971). *America's charitable cooks: A bibliography of fund-raising cook books published in the United States (1861–1915)*. Kent, OH: Margaret Cook.
- Dagger, R. (1997). *Civic virtues: Rights, citizenship, and republican liberalism: Rights, citizenship, and republican liberalism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Equal suffrage league of Wayne county. (1916). *Suffrage cook book: A collection of recipes*. Detroit: The Equal Suffrage League of Wayne County.
- Ferguson, K. (2012). Intensifying taste, intensifying identity: Collectivity through community cookbooks. *Signs*, 37, 695–717. doi:10.1086/662697
- Ferree, M. M. (2003). Resonance and radicalism: Feminist framing in the abortion debates of the United States and Germany. *American Journal of Sociology*, 109, 304–344. doi:10.1086/378343
- Gamson, W., & Modigliani, A. (1989). Media discourse and public opinion on nuclear power: A constructionist approach. *American Journal of Sociology*, 95(1), 1–37. doi:10.1086/229213

- Griswold, W. (1987). The fabrication of meaning: Literary interpretation in the United States, Great Britain, and the West Indies. *American Journal of Sociology*, 92, 1077–1117.
- Haydu, J. (2008). *Citizen employers: Business communities and labor in Cincinnati and San Francisco*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Hewitt, L., & McCammon, H. J. (2004). Explaining suffrage mobilization: Balance, neutralization, and range in collective action frames, 1892–1919. *Mobilization: An International Journal*, 9, 149–166.
- Hoar, M. B. S. (1915). *Enfranchised cookery*. New York City, NY: National Woman Suffrage Publishing Company.
- Isaac, L. W. (2012). Literary activists and battling books: The labor problem novel as contentious movement medium. *Research in Social Movements, Conflicts and Change*, 33, 17–49.
- Jauss, H. R. (1982). *Toward an aesthetic of reception*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Jennings, L. D. (1909). *Washington women's cook book*. Seattle, WA: Washington Equal Suffrage Association.
- Kerber, L. (1980). *Women of the republic: Intellect and ideology in revolutionary America*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- Kleber, L. O. (1915). *The suffrage cook book*. Pittsburgh: The Equal Franchise Federation of Western Pennsylvania.
- Kraditor, A. S. (1965). *The ideas of the woman suffrage movement, 1890–1920*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.
- Levenstein, H. A. (1988). *Revolution at the table: The transformation of the American diet*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Longone, J. B. (1997). 'Tried receipts': An overview of America's charitable cookbooks. In A. L. Bower (Ed.), *Recipes for reading: Community cookbooks, stories, histories* (pp. 17–28). Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press.
- Mayring, P. (2004). Qualitative content analysis. In U. Flick, E. von Kardorff, & I. Steinke (Eds.), *A companion to qualitative research* (pp. 266–269). London: Sage Publications.
- McCammon, H. J. (2003). 'Out of the parlors and into the streets': The changing tactical repertoire of the U.S. women's suffrage movements. *Social Forces*, 81, 787–818. doi:10.1353/sof.2003.0037
- McCammon, H. J., & Campbell, K. E. (2001). Winning the vote in the west: The political successes of the women's suffrage movements, 1866–1919. *Gender & Society*, 15, 55–82. doi:10.1177/089124301015001004
- McCammon, H. J., Campbell, K. E., Granberg, E. M., & Mowery, C. (2001). How movements win: Gendered opportunity structures and U.S. women's suffrage movements, 1866 to 1919. *American Sociological Review*, 66, 49–70. doi:10.2307/2657393
- Morrison, D. R., & Isaac, L. W. (2012). Insurgent images: Genre selection and visual frame amplification in IWW cartoon art. *Social Movement Studies: Journal of Social, Cultural and Political Protest*, 11, 61–78. doi:10.1080/14742837.2012.640530
- Neuhaus, J. (2003). *Manly meals and mom's home cooking: Cookbooks and gender in Modern America*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University.
- Nussel, J. (2006). Heating up the sources: Using community cookbooks in historical inquiry. *History Compass*, 4, 956–961. doi:10.1111/j.1478-0542.2006.00342.x
- Oliver, P. E., & Johnston, H. (2000). What a good idea! Ideologies and frames in social movement research. *Mobilization: An International Journal*, 4, 37–54.
- Quigley, D. R. (2002). 'The proud name of 'citizen' has sunk': Suffrage restriction, class formation, and the Tilden commission of 1877. *American Nineteenth Century History*, 3, 69–92. doi:10.1080/713998989
- Richards, C. K. (2008). *The awakening: Rhetoric and the rise of new women in the New Northwest, 1868–1912* (PhD dissertation). Northwestern University, Evanston, IL.
- Rockford Equal Suffrage Association. (1891). *Holiday gift cook book*. Rockford, IL: Rockford Equal Suffrage Association.
- Rohlinger, D. A., Kail, B., Taylor, M., & Conn, S. (2012). Outside the mainstream: Social movement organization media coverage in mainstream and partisan news outlets. *Research in Social Movements, Conflicts and Change*, 33, 51–80.
- Schenone, L. (2003). *A thousand years over a hot stove: A history of American women told through food, recipes, and remembrances*. New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Company.
- Seinfeld, J. (2008). *Deceptively delicious: Simple secrets to get your kids eating good food*. New York, NY: William Morrow.
- Shapiro, L. (1986). *Perfection salad: Women and cooking at the turn of the century*. New York, NY: Henry Holt.

- Snow, D. A., & Benford, R. D. (1988). Ideology, frame resonance, and participant mobilization. In B. Klandermans, H.-P. Kriesi, & S. Tarrow (Eds.), *From structure to action: Social movement participation across cultures* (pp. 197–217). Greenwich, CT: JAI Press.
- Snow, D. A., Rochford, Jr., E. B., Worden, S. K., & Benford, R. D. (1986). Frame alignment processes, micromobilization, and movement participation. *American Sociological Review*, *51*, 464–481. doi:[10.2307/2095581](https://doi.org/10.2307/2095581)
- Snow, D. A., Tan, A. E., & Owens, P. B. (2013). Social movements, framing processes, and cultural revitalization and fabrication. *Mobilization: An International Journal*, *18*, 225–242.
- Welter, B. (1966). The cult of true womanhood: 1820–1860. *American Quarterly*, *18*, 151–174. doi:[10.2307/2711179](https://doi.org/10.2307/2711179)

Stacy J. Williams is a doctoral candidate in the Department of Sociology at the University of California, San Diego and a visiting scholar at New York University's Department of Nutrition, Food Studies, and Public Health. Her research interests include social movements, culture, gender, and food. Her dissertation studies feminist cookbooks and other writings about food to examine how food can become infused with gender politics.